

# POLITECNICO MILANO 1863

# Spatio-temporal detection of defects is SLM by using in-situ high-speed vision

January 23-24, 2017

## Marco Grasso and Bianca Maria Colosimo

Department of Mechanical Engineering, Politecnico di Milano (Italy) marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it



AddMe.Lab – Additive Manufacturing lab @ Department of Mechanical Engineering (Politecnico di Milano) *Who we are* 

### **Three Full Professors**



**Prof. Q. Semeraro** Quality Control & Process optimization

### **Two Assistant Professors**



Ali G. Demir Laser processes



Marco Grasso Process monitoring & quality control

Prof. B.M.Colosimo

Process monitoring

& quality Control

## Seven PhD students and research assistants



**Prof. B. Previtali** Laser processes

Chiara De Giorgi Vittorio Laguzza

Giulia Repossini

**Stefania Cacace** 

Marco Montani

Giorgia Galimberti

**Claire Bruna Rosso** 

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# AddMe.Lab – Additive Manufacturing lab @ Department of Mechanical Engineering (Politecnico di Milano) *Processes and technologies*



### marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# AddMe.Lab – Additive Manufacturing lab @ Department of Mechanical Engineering (Politecnico di Milano) *Post-process and metrology equipment*





### NSI x25 system

- Maximum Power: 160 kV/0W
- Nominal resolution < 1mm
- Max sample volume: 15 cm x 20 cm x 70 cm
- Max weight: 11 Kg
- Detector: 149 mm x 119 mm

### marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# Statistical monitoring of PRODUCT and PROCESS data







in control surface

 BM Colosimo, Q Semeraro, M Pacella (2008)
 Statistical process control for geometric specifications: on the monitoring of roundness profiles, JQT 40 (1)

- BM Colosimo, P Cicorella, M Pacella, M Blaco (2014) From profile to surface monitoring: SPC for cylindrical surfaces via Gaussian Processes JQT 46 (2), 95
- BM Colosimo, M Pacella, N Senin (2015)
  Multisensor data fusion via Gaussian process models for dimensional and geometric verification Precision Engineering 40, 199-213



### marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# Statistical monitoring of PRODUCT and PROCESS data



- Grasso M., Menafoglio A., Colosimo B. M., Secchi P. (2016), Using Curve Registration Information to Enhance Profile Monitoring of Signal Data, JQT, 48(2)
- Grasso M., Colosimo B.M., Pacella M. (2014), Profile Monitoring via Sensor Fusion: the use of PCA Methods for Multi-Channel Data, IJPR, 52 (20)
- Grasso M., Chatterton S., Pennacchi P., Colosimo B.M., (2016), A Data-Driven Method to Enhance Vibration Signal Decomposition for Rolling Bearing Fault Analysis, MSSP, 81, 126-147



### marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# Towards zero-defect in metal AM

### Statistical process monitoring and data mining techniques applied to metal AM



## Goal:

Quickly detect the onset of defects during the process via in-situ sensing

### Challenges:

- Automated alarm rules when there is no time to learn
- Identification of WHEN and WHERE the defect has originated within the part
- Processing and analysis of large amounts of high frequency data streams

6

| Monitored signature  |                                   | In-situ sensing (main categories)  |   |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---|---|-------------------------|--|--|--|--|
|                      |                                   | Pyrometry  | Imaging<br>(visible to NIR)   | Thermal imaging<br>(NIR to LWIR)  | Interferometric imaging |  |  |  |  |
| Melt pool            | Size                              | Clijsters et al., 2014; Craeghs et al., 2010 -<br>2011;  | Craeghs et al., 2010 - 2012; Clijsters et al.,<br>2014; Berumen et al., 2010; Kruth et al.,<br>2007; Van Gestel, 2015 |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Shape                             |  | Craeghs et al., 2011;<br>Berumen et al., 2010;<br>Van Gestel, 2015; Kruth et al., 2007                                | Doubenskaia et al., 2015  |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>intensity          | Craeghs et al., 2011; Berumen et al.,<br>2010; Chivel, 2013; Clijsters et al., 2014;<br>Doubenskaia et al., 2012; Pavlov et al.,<br>2010; Thombansen et al., 2015; | Berumen et al., 2010; Van Gestel, 2015;<br>Yadroitsev et al., 2014; Chivel, 2013;                                     |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  | Doubenskaia et al., 2012;   | Gong et al., 2013b; Price et al., 2012  |                         |  |  |  |  |
| Track (scan<br>path) | Track geometry                    |  |   | Doubenskaia et al., 2015  | Kanko et al., 2016      |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature/<br>intensity profile | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008;<br>Thombansen et al., 2015  | Grasso et al., 2016   | Krauss et al., 2012 - 2014;<br>Lane et al., 2015; Bayle and Doubenskaia,<br>2008; Gong et al., 2013b; Price et al.,<br>2012; Schilp et al., 2014; |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Ejected material                  | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008  |   | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008; Lane et al.,<br>2015   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Surface pattern                   |  | Foster et al., 2015; zur Jacobsmühlen et<br>al., 2013; Kleszczynski et al., 2012; Zhang<br>et al., 2016               | Ridwan et al., 2014; Schwerdtfeger et al.,<br>2012; Mireles et al., 2015; Dinwiddie et<br>al., 2013   | Neef et al., 2014       |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Geometry                          |  | Foster et al., 2015   | Ridwan et al., 2014   |                         |  |  |  |  |
| Slice                | Thickness profile                 |  | zur Jacobsmühlen et al., 2013 - 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012; Land et al., 2015;<br>Zhang et al., 2016          |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature/<br>intensity profile |  | Grasso et al., 2016   | Krauss et al. 2014; Rodriguez et al., 2012 -<br>2015; Schilp et al., 2014; Wegner and<br>Witt, 2011; Dinwiddie et al., 2013                       |                         |  |  |  |  |
| Powder bed           | Homogeneity                       |  | Foster et al. 2015;   |   | Neef et al., 2014       |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>intensity          | Islam et al., 2013   |   |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  |   | Wegner and Witt, 2011   |                         |  |  |  |  |

| Monitored signature  |                                   | In-situ sensing (main categories)  |   |  |   |                         |  |  |  |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---|--|---|-------------------------|--|--|--|
|                      |                                   | Pyrometry  | Imaging<br>(visible to NIR)   |  | Thermal imaging<br>(NIR to LWIR)  | Interferometric imaging |  |  |  |
| Melt pool            | Size                              | Clijsters et al., 2014; Craeghs et al., 2010 -<br>2011;  | Craeghs et al., 2010 - 2012; Clijsters et al.,<br>2014; Berumen et al., 2010; Kruth et al.,<br>2007; Van Gestel, 2015 |  |   |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Shape                             |  | Craeghs et al., 2011;<br>Berumen et al., 2010; D<br>Van Gestel, 2015; Kruth et al., 2007                              |  | Doubenskaia et al., 2015  |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>intensity          | Craeghs et al., 2011; Berumen et al.,<br>2010; Chivel, 2013; Clijsters et al., 2014;<br>Doubenskaia et al., 2012; Pavlov et al.,<br>2010; Thombansen et al., 2015; | Berumen et al., 2010; Van Gestel, 2015;<br>Yadroitsev et al., 2014; Chivel, 2013;                                     |  |   |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  | Doubenskaia et al., 2012;   |  | Gong et al., 2013b; Price et al., 2012  |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Track geometry                    |  |   |  | Doubenskaia et al., 2015  | Kanko et al., 2016      |  |  |  |
| Track (scan<br>path) | Temperature/<br>intensity profile | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008;<br>Thombansen et al., 2015  | Grasso et al., 2016   |  | Krauss et al., 2012 - 2014;<br>Lane et al., 2015; Bayle and Doubenskaia,<br>2008; Gong et al., 2013b; Price et al.,<br>2012; Schilp et al., 2014; |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Ejected material                  | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008  |   |  | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008; Lane et al.,<br>2015   |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Surface pattern                   |  | Foster et al., 2015; zur Jacobsmühlen et<br>al., 2013; Kleszczynski et al., 2012; Zhang<br>et al., 2016               |  | Ridwan et al., 2014; Schwerdtfeger et al.,<br>2012; Mireles et al., 2015; Dinwiddie et<br>al., 2013   | Neef et al., 2014       |  |  |  |
|                      | Geometry                          |  | Foster et al., 2015   |  | Ridwan et al., 2014   |                         |  |  |  |
| Slice                | Thickn Monito                     | ring tools more co   | Izur Jacobsmühlen et al., 2013 - 2015;<br><b>nsolidated in</b>  |  |   |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | industry (images acquired         |  | before and  |  | Krauss et al. 2014; Rodriguez et al., 2012 -<br>2015; Schilp et al., 2014; Wegner and<br>Witt, 2011; Dinwiddie et al., 2013                       |                         |  |  |  |
| Powder bed           | Homos after sc                    | canning)   |   |  |   | Neef et al., 2014       |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>intensity          | Islam et al., 2013   |   |  |   |                         |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  |   |  | Wegner and Witt, 2011   |                         |  |  |  |

from: Grasso, Colosimo, *Process Defects and In-situ Monitoring Methods in Metal Powder Bed Fusion: a Review,* Measurement Science and Technology, 2017

| Monitored s          | ignature                          | Pyrometry  |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
|                      | Size                              | Clijsters et al., 2014; Craeghs et al., 2010<br>2011;  |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Shape                             |  |  |  |  |  |
| Melt pool            | Temperature<br>intensity          | Craeghs et al., 2011; Berumen et al.,<br>2010; Chivel, 2013; Clijsters et al., 2014;<br>Doubenskaia et al., 2012; Pavlov et al.,<br>2010; Thombansen et al., 2015; |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            | Ĺ  |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Track geometry                    |  |  |  |  |  |
| Track (scan<br>path) | Temperature/<br>intensity profile | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008;<br>Thombansen et al., 2015  |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Ejected material                  | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008  |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Surface pattern                   | F  |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Geometry                          | F  |  |  |  |  |
| Slice                | Thickn Monito                     | y (images acquired   |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Homos after sc                    | canning)   |  |  |  |  |
| Powder bed           | Temperature<br>intensity          | Islam et al., 2013   |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  |  |  |  |  |





### **Original image**





| Monitored signature  |                                   | In-situ sensing (main categories)  |   |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------|-----------------------------------|--|---|---|-------------------------|--|--|--|--|
|                      |                                   | Domester   | Imaging   | Thermal imaging   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      |                                   | Pyrometry  | (visible to NIR)  | (NIR to LWIR)   | Interferometric imaging |  |  |  |  |
| Melt pool            | Size                              | Clijsters et al., 2014; Craeghs et al., 2010 -<br>2011;  | Craeghs et al., 2010 - 2012; Clijsters et al.,<br>2014; Berumen et al., 2010; Kruth et al.,<br>2007; Van Gestel, 2015 |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Shape                             |  | Craeghs et al., 2011;<br>Berumen et al., 2010;<br>Van Gestel, 2015; Kruth et al., 2007                                | Doubenskaia et al., 2015  |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>intensity          | Craeghs et al., 2011; Berumen et al.,<br>2010; Chivel, 2013; Clijsters et al., 2014;<br>Doubenskaia et al., 2012; Pavlov et al.,<br>2010; Thombansen et al., 2015; | Berumen et al., 2010; Van Gestel, 2015;<br>Yadroitsev et al., 2014; Chivel, 2013;                                     |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  | Doubenskaia et al., 2012;   | Gong et al., 2013b; Price et al., 2012  |                         |  |  |  |  |
| Track (scan<br>path) | Track geometry                    |  |   | Doubenskaia et al., 2015  | Kanko et al., 2016      |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature/<br>intensity profile | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008;<br>Thombansen et al., 2015  | Grasso et al., 2016   | Krauss et al., 2012 - 2014;<br>Lane et al., 2015; Bayle and Doubenskaia,<br>2008; Gong et al., 2013b; Price et al.,<br>2012; Schilp et al., 2014; |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Ejected material                  | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008  |   | Bayle and Doubenskaia, 2008; Lane et al.,<br>2015   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Surface pattern                   |  | Foster et al., 2015; zur Jacobsmühlen et<br>al., 2013; Kleszczynski et al., 2012; Zhang<br>et al., 2016               | Ridwan et al., 2014; Schwerdtfeger et al.,<br>2012; Mireles et al., 2015; Dinwiddie et<br>al., 2013   | Neef et al., 2014       |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Geometry                          |  | Foster et al., 2015   | Ridwan et al., 2014   |                         |  |  |  |  |
| Slice                | Thickness profile                 |  | zur Jacobsmühlen et al., 2013 - 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012; Land et al., 2015;<br>Zhang et al., 2016          |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature/<br>intensity profile |  | Grasso et al., 2016   | Krauss et al. 2014; Rodriguez et al., 2012 -<br>2015; Schilp et al., 2014; Wegner and<br>Witt, 2011; Dinwiddie et al., 2013                       |                         |  |  |  |  |
| Powder bed           | Homogeneity                       |  | Foster et al. 2015;   |   | Neef et al., 2014       |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>intensity          | Islam et al., 2013   |   |   |                         |  |  |  |  |
|                      | Temperature<br>profile            |  |   | Wegner and Witt, 2011   |                         |  |  |  |  |

# Typology and sources of defects in PBF

| Sources of defects |   | Categories of defects   |  |   |   |  |  |  |
|--------------------|---|---|--|---|---|--|--|--|
|                    |   | Porosity  | Balling  | Geometric defects   | Surface defects   | Residual stresses, cracks & delamination   | Microstructural<br>inhomog. &<br>impurity  |  |
|                    | Beam<br>scanning/<br>deflection         | Foster et al., 2015   |  | Moylan et al., 2014b; Foster<br>et al., 2015                                  |   |  |  |  |
| ipmen              | Build chamber<br>environment            | Ferrar et al., 2012; Spears and Gold,<br>2016   | Li et al., 2012  |   |   | Edwards et al., 2013; Chlebus et<br>al., 2011; Buchbinder et al., 2014;<br>Kempen et al., 2013   | Spears and Gold, 2016  |  |
| Equi               | Powder<br>handling &<br>deposition      | Foster et al., 2015   |  | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012                             | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012   |  | Foster et al., 2015  |  |
|                    | Baseplate                               |   |  | Prabhakar et al., 2015  |   | Prabhakar et al., 2015   |  |  |
| Process            | Parameters<br>and scan<br>strategy      | Matthews et al., 2016; Yasa et al.,<br>2009; Attar, 2011; Gong, 2013; Read<br>et al., 2015; Kruth et al., 2004;<br>Weingarten et al., 2015; Thijs et al.,<br>2010; Scharowsky et al., 2015;<br>Puebla et al., 2012; Tammas-<br>Williams et al., 2015; Biamino et al.,<br>2011; Zeng, 2015 | Li et al., 2012; Kruth<br>et al., 2004; Tolochko<br>et al., 2004; Zhou et<br>al., 2015; Attar, 2011;<br>Gong, 2013 | Yasa et al., 2009; Mousa,<br>2016; Kleszczynski et al.,<br>2012; Thomas, 2009 | Li et al., 2012; Kruth et al.,<br>2004; Matthews et al.,<br>2016; Attar, 2011; Gong,<br>2013; Zaeh and Kanhert,<br>2009; Delgado et al.,<br>2012; | Mercelis and Kruth, 2006; Parry et<br>al., 2016; Cheng et al., 2016; Van<br>Belle et al., 2013; Casavola et al.,<br>2008; Zah and Lutzmann, 2010;<br>Zaeh and Branner, 2010; Kempen<br>et al., 2013; Kruth et al., 2004;<br>Carter et al., 2012 - 2014 | Carter et al., 2012 - 2014;<br>Arisoy et al., 2016; Niu<br>and Chang, 1999; Huang<br>et al., 2016; Thijs et al.,<br>2010; Scharowsky et al.,<br>2015; Puebla et al., 2012;<br>Biamino et al., 2011 |  |
|                    | Byproducts<br>and material<br>ejections | Liu et al., 2015; Khairallah et al.,<br>2016;   |  |   |   |  | Liu et al., 2015;<br>Khairallah et al., 2016;  |  |
| Design<br>choices  | Supports                                |   |  | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012;<br>Zeng, 2015              | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012;<br>Zeng, 2015  | Foster et al., 2015; Kleszczynski et<br>al., 2012; Zeng, 2015  |  |  |
|                    | Orientation                             |   | Li et al., 2012; Strano<br>et al., 2013;   | Delgado et al., 2012  | Delgado et al., 2012; Fox<br>et al., 2016; Strano et al.,<br>2013   |  | Meier and Haberland,<br>2008   |  |
| eedstock material  |   | Liu et al., 2015; Van Elsen, 2007;<br>Das, 2003   |  | Das, 2003   | Seyda et al., 2012  |  | Das, 2003; Niu and<br>Chang, 1999; Huang et<br>al 2016   |  |

# Typology and sources of defects in PBF

|  |   | Catagorias of defacts   |   |   |   |  |  |  |
|--|---|---|---|---|---|--|--|--|
| Sources of defects                                     |   |   | 1   | Categories  |   |  |  |  |
|  |   | Porosity  | Balling   | Geometric defects                                 | Surface defects   | Residual stresses, cracks & delamination   | Microstructural<br>inhomog. &<br>impurity  |  |
|  | Beam<br>scanning/<br>deflection         | Foster et al., 2015   |   | Moylan et al., 2014b; Foster<br>et al., 2015      |   |  |  |  |
| ipment   | Build chamber<br>environment            | Ferrar et al., 2012; Spears and Gold,<br>2016   | Li et al., 2012                                 |   |   | Edwards et al., 2013; Chlebus et<br>al., 2011; Buchbinder et al., 2014;<br>Kempen et al., 2013   | Spears and Gold, 2016  |  |
| Equi   | Powder<br>handling &<br>deposition      | Foster et al., 2015   |   | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012 | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012   |  | Foster et al., 2015  |  |
|  | Baseplate                               |   |   | Prabhakar et al., 2015                            |   | Prabhakar et al., 2015   |  |  |
| Param<br>and so<br>strate<br>Bypro<br>and m<br>ejectio | Parameters<br>and scan<br>strategy      | Matthews et al., 2016; Yasa et al.,<br>2009; Attar. 2011: Gong. 2013: Read<br>Local geom<br>Puebla e caused by n<br>Williams<br>2011; Ze parameters | <br>etrical defe<br>ion-optima<br>in critical f | ects may be<br>Il process<br>features and/        | Li et al 2012; Kruth et al.,<br>thews et al.,<br>r, 2011; Gong,<br>n and Kanhert,<br>;ado et al., | Mercelis and Kruth, 2006; Parry et<br>al., 2016; Cheng et al., 2016; Van<br>Belle et al., 2013; Casavola et al.,<br>2008; Zah and Lutzmann, 2010;<br>Zaeh and Branner, 2010; Kempen<br>et al., 2013; Kruth et al., 2004;<br>Carter et al., 2012 - 2014 | Carter et al., 2012 - 2014;<br>Arisoy et al., 2016; Niu<br>and Chang, 1999; Huang<br>et al., 2016; Thijs et al.,<br>2010; Scharowsky et al.,<br>2015; Puebla et al., 2012;<br>Biamino et al., 2011 |  |
|  | Byproducts<br>and material<br>ejections | Liu et al.<br>2016;<br>Hot-spot (lo   | l supportir<br><b>ocal over-h</b>               | ng strategies<br>Reating)                         |   |  | Liu et al., 2015;<br>Khairallah et al., 2016;  |  |
| Design<br>choices                                      | Supports                                | detection a   | nd localiza                                     | tion methods                                      | II., 2015;<br>ki et al., 2012;  | Foster et al., 2015; Kleszczynski et<br>al., 2012; Zeng, 2015  |  |  |
|  | Orientation                             |   | Li et al., 2012; Strano<br>et al., 2013;        | Delgado et al., 2012                              | Delgado et al., 2012; Fox<br>et al., 2016; Strano et al.,<br>2013                                 |  | Meier and Haberland,<br>2008   |  |
| eedstock material powder)                              |   | Liu et al., 2015; Van Elsen, 2007;<br>Das, 2003   |   | Das, 2003   | Seyda et al., 2012  |  | Das, 2003; Niu and<br>Chang, 1999; Huang et<br>al., 2016   |  |

# Typology and sources of defects in PBF

| Sources of defects |   | Categories of defects  |   |   |   |  |  |  |  |
|--------------------|---|--|---|---|---|--|--|--|--|
|                    |   | Porosity   | Balling   | Geometric defects   | Surface defects   | Residual stresses, cracks & delamination   | Microstructural<br>inhomog. &<br>impurity  |  |  |
|                    | Beam<br>scanning/<br>deflection         | Foster et al., 2015  |   | Moylan et al., 2014b; Foster<br>et al., 2015  |   |  |  |  |  |
| ipmen              | Build chamber<br>environment            | Ferrar et al., 2012; Spears and Gold,<br>2016  | Li et al., 2012   |   |   | Edwards et al., 2013; Chlebus et<br>al., 2011; Buchbinder et al., 2014;<br>Kempen et al., 2013   | Spears and Gold, 2016  |  |  |
| Equi               | Powder<br>handling &<br>deposition      | Foster et al., 2015  |   | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012   | Foster et al., 2015;<br>Kleszczynski et al., 2012   |  | Foster et al., 2015  |  |  |
|                    | Baseplate                               |  |   | Prabhakar et al., 2015  |   | Prabhakar et al., 2015   |  |  |  |
| Process            | Parameters<br>and scan<br>strategy      | Matthews et al., 2016; Yasa et al.,<br>2009; Attar, 2011; Gong, 2013; Read<br>et al., 2015; Kruth et al., 2004;<br>Weingarten et al., 2015; Thijs et al.,<br>2010; Scharowsky et al., 2015;<br>Puebla<br>William<br>2011: Ze <b>Study of spa</b> | Li et al., 2012; Kruth<br>et al., 2004; Tolochko<br>et al., 2004; Zhou et<br>al., 2015; Attar, 2011;<br>atter behav | Yasa et al., 2009; Mousa,<br>2016; Kleszczynski et al.,<br>2012: Thomas. 2009<br><b>viour produce</b> | Li et al., 2012; Kruth et al.,<br>2004; Matthews et al.,<br>2016; Attar, 2011; Gong,<br>2013; Zaeh and Kanhert,<br>gado et al., | Mercelis and Kruth, 2006; Parry et<br>al., 2016; Cheng et al., 2016; Van<br>Belle et al., 2013; Casavola et al.,<br>2008; Zah and Lutzmann, 2010;<br>Zaeh and Branner, 2010; Kempen<br>et al., 2013; Kruth et al., 2004;<br>Carter et al., 2012 - 2014 | Carter et al., 2012 - 2014;<br>Arisoy et al., 2016; Niu<br>and Chang, 1999; Huang<br>et al., 2016; Thijs et al.,<br>2010; Scharowsky et al.,<br>2015; Puebla et al., 2012;<br>Biamino et al., 2011 |  |  |
|                    | Byproducts<br>and material<br>ejections | by the laser,<br>which are re  | /material i<br>lated to p   | nteraction,<br>rocess stabilit  | у   |  | Liu et al., 2015;<br>Khairallah et al., 2016;  |  |  |
| Design<br>choices  | Supports                                | and local de   | fects   | Zeng, 2015  | al., 2015;<br>ski et al., 2012;<br>Zeng, 2015   | Foster et al., 2015; Kleszczynski et<br>al., 2012; Zeng, 2015  |  |  |  |
|                    | Orientation                             |  | Li et al., 2012; Strano<br>et al., 2013;  | Delgado et al., 2012  | Delgado et al., 2012; Fox<br>et al., 2016; Strano et al.,<br>2013   |  | Meier and Haberland,<br>2008   |  |  |
| eedstock material  |   | Liu et al., 2015; Van Elsen, 2007;<br>Das, 2003  |   | Das, 2003   | Seyda et al., 2012  |  | Das, 2003; Niu and<br>Chang, 1999; Huang et<br>al., 2016   |  |  |

# Hot-spot detection and localization in SLM *Case study*

### Example of local over-heating in down-facing acute corners (AISI 316L steel)



Grasso et al. (2016) In-process Monitoring of Selective Laser Melting: Spatial Detection of Defects via Image Data Analysis. Journal of Manufacturing Science and Engineering, 139(5), 051001-1-16.

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

## POLITECNICO MILANO 1863

9



marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it



marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it



marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it



### **Statistical descriptors**

 $T^{2}(X,Y)$  SPE(X,Y) Hotelling's Squared PCA distance residuals

### Temporal correlation (pixel intensity profile)



### Spatial mapping (statistical descriptor)



POLITECNICO MILANO 1863

12

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

**Spatial clustering-based alarm rule** (*Hastie et al., 2009; Tisbshirani et al., 2001*)

- 1 cluster: no hot-spot, process in-control
- 2 clusters (or >2): hot-spot detected, process out-of-control (alarm)



marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

### Benefits against competitor methods



marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

14

# Spatter behaviour analysis for process monitoring in SLM

Repossini *et al.* 2017, *Spatter behaviour in Selective Laser Melting as process signature for in-situ monitoring*, Additive Manufacturing (under review)

# Spatters generated by the laser/material interaction could be suitable *process signatures* for SLM process monitoring?

- "droplet spatters" and "powder spatters" (Liu et al., 2011; Khairallah et al., 2016)
- OOC spatter behaviour may produce inclusions
  & powder bed inhomogeneity (Gong, 2013)
- Lack of studies on correlation between spatter behaviour and SLM process quality



### Image processing approach

High-speed image acquisition (1000 Hz)



Image segmentation and classification between laser heated zone (LHZ) and spatters





Estimation of statistical descriptors of spatter behaviour

(average area, spatial spread, number,...)

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# Spatter behaviour analysis for process monitoring in SLM

Repossini *et al.* 2017, *Spatter behaviour in Selective Laser Melting as process signature for in-situ monitoring*, Additive Manufacturing (under review)

### Study of spatter behaviour under different energy density conditions (maraging steel)



POLITECNICO MILANO 1863

16

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# Spatter behaviour analysis for process monitoring in SLM

Repossini *et al.* 2017, *Spatter behaviour in Selective Laser Melting as process signature for in-situ monitoring*, Additive Manufacturing (under review)

**Classification of energy density conditions via logistic regression** 

Three classification models were compared:

- 1. Only LHZ area (benchmark)
- 2. LHZ + spatters
- 3. Only spatters

### **Results:**

- Inclusion of spatter-related descriptors enhances the classification performances with respect to including only laser heated zone area
- Spatter behaviour can be used as a proxy of process stability (to be further investigated in future studies)



### 95% CI for Mean Misclassification Error (40 um)

# **Challenges and next steps**

### Challenges and barriers to face

• Computational feasibility:

Breadboard implementation on real-time platform needed to improve the computational efficiency (possibility of monitoring larger areas);

- Integration & synchronization of image acquisition system with machine controller
- Big data stream management for continuous process monitoring

### Next steps

Study of **multi-sensor data fusion** methods to enhance process monitoring performances

- co-axial + off-axis sensing (process monitoring at multiple levels)
- Evaluation of novel in-situ sensing solutions

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it

# Thanks for your attention





Casati et al. 2016. Microstructure and Fracture Behavior of 316L Austenitic Stainless Steel Produced by Selective Laser Melting. *Journal of Materials Science & Technology*, 32(8), 738-744.

Khairallah et al. 2016, Laser powder-bed fusion additive manufacturing: Physics of complex melt flow and formation mechanisms of pores, spatter, and denudation zones. Acta Materialia, 108, 36-45.

Gong 2013, Generation and detection of defects in metallic parts fabricated by selective laser melting and electron beam melting and their effects on mechanical properties. UofL Electronic Theses and Dissertations. Paper 515.http://dx.doi.org/10.18297/etd/515

- Grasso, Colosimo, 2017, Process Defects and In-situ Monitoring Methods in Metal Powder Bed Fusion: a Review, Measurement Science and Technology, https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6501/aa5c4f
- Grasso et al. 2016, In-process Monitoring of Selective Laser Melting: Spatial Detection of Defects via Image Data Analysis. Journal of Manufacturing Science and Engineering, 139(5), 051001-1-16.
- Hastie et al. 2009. Unsupervised learning. In The elements of statistical learning (485-585). Springer New York. Liu et al. 2015. *Investigation into spatter behavior during selective laser melting of AISI 316L stainless steel powder*. Materials & Design, 87, 797-806.
- Repossini et al. 2017, Spatter behaviour in Selective Laser Melting as process signature for in-situ monitoring, Additive Manufacturing (under review)
- Tibshirani et al. 2001, *Estimating the number of clusters in a data set via the gap statistic*. Journal of the Royal Statistical Society: Series B. Vol. 63, Part 2, 411–423.

Zäh, M. F., & Lutzmann, S. (2010). Modelling and simulation of electron beam melting. *Production Engineering*, *4*(1), 15-23.

marcoluigi.grasso@polimi.it, biancamaria.colosimo@polimi.it